

PRESERVATION EDUCATION & RESEARCH

VOLUME 8 | 2016

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR
PRESERVATION EDUCATION

NCPE

PER is published annually as a single volume. Copyright © 2016 *Preservation Education & Research*. All rights reserved. Articles, essays, reports and reviews appearing in this journal may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, except for classroom and noncommercial use, including illustrations, in any form (beyond copying permitted by sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law), without written permission.

ISSN 1946-5904

Cover photograph credit: Kate Russell Photography

PRESERVATION EDUCATION & RESEARCH

VOLUME 8 EDITORS

Jeremy C. Wells, *Roger Williams University*
(jwells@rwu.edu)

Rebecca J. Sheppard, *University of Delaware*
(rjshep@udel.edu)

ADVISORY EDITORIAL BOARD

Steven Hoffman, *Southeast Missouri State University*

Carter L. Hudgins, *Clemson University/College of Charleston*

Paul Hardin Kapp, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign*

Ted J. Ligibel, *Eastern Michigan University*

Vincent L. Michael, *San Antonio Conservation Society*

Andréa Livi Smith, *University of Mary Washington*

Michael A. Tomlan, *Cornell University*

Robert Young, *University of Utah*

NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR PRESERVATION EDUCATION EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Paul Hardin Kapp, Chair,
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Amalia Leifeste, Vice Chair and Memberships,
Clemson University

Andréa Livi Smith, Vice Chair and Web Site Editor,
University of Mary Washington

Steven Hoffman, Secretary,
Southeast Missouri State University

Douglas Appler, Treasurer,
University of Kentucky

Cari Goetcheus, Internships,
University of Georgia

Michael Tomlan, Special Projects,
Cornell University

Lauren Weiss Bricker, Chair Emerita,
California State Polytechnic University, Pomona

Robert Young, Chair Emeritus,
University of Utah

Preservation Education & Research (PER) disseminates international peer-reviewed scholarship relevant to historic environment education from fields such as historic preservation, heritage conservation, heritage studies, building and landscape conservation, urban conservation, and cultural patrimony. The National Council for Preservation Education (NCPE) launched PER in 2007 as part of its mission to exchange and disseminate information and ideas concerning historic environment education, current developments and innovations in conservation, and the improvement of historic environment education programs and endeavors in the United States and abroad.

Editorial correspondence, including manuscripts for submission, should be emailed to Gregory Donofrio donofrio@unm.edu and Chad Randl at cgr5@cornell.edu. Electronic submissions are encouraged, but physical materials can be mailed to Gregory Donofrio, School of Architecture, University of Minnesota, 145 Rapson Hall, 89 Church Street S.E., Minneapolis, MN 55455, USA. Articles should be in the range of 4,500 to 6,000 words and not be under consideration for publication or previously published elsewhere. Refer to the back of this volume for manuscript guidelines.

Books for review, and book reviews, should be sent to Gregory Donofrio, School of Architecture, University of Minnesota, 145 Rapson Hall, 89 Church Street S.E., Minneapolis, MN 55455, USA. E-mail donofrio@umn.edu.

Subscriptions are US\$60.00 per year. Payments can be made online at the NCPE Store (<http://www.ncpe.us/storemembership>) or send a check with name and mailing address to PER, c/o NCPE, Box 291, Ithaca, NY 14851, USA.

to be generous in my explanations of American terminology, laws, and sites). Third (these are lesser, but still annoying points), the book could have benefitted from more careful copy editing and more thorough indexing. Finally, more judicious selection of illustrations and culling of several chapters might have helped keep the book price at an affordable level (though I realize this is a widespread problem in publishing).

These criticisms aside, I am glad I had the opportunity to read this book. It broadened my perspective on a number of issues, and a few chapters were accessible, even entertaining. One of my favorites, by arts lecturer Brett Lashua and architect Simon Baker, was on using a protected heritage site in Leeds for an open-air “pop-up” cinema event. Clearly they are accustomed to working

and communicating with diverse public audiences.

The concluding chapter reiterates some of the book’s key themes: “non-expert access, appropriation, ownership and the creation or co-creation of heritage” as well as bigger questions of “knowledge and power” and “debates about democracy and participation” (244). While not all chapters are equally successful in addressing these themes, the book overall makes an important contribution to the ongoing discussion of what heritage is and who gets to decide.

PHYLLIS MAUCH MESSENGER

University of Minnesota

Minneapolis, Minnesota (USA)

Michael A. Tomlan. *Historic Preservation: Caring for Our Expanding Legacy*. New York: Springer International, 2014, xxxvi + 383 pp., color and black-and-white illustrations, hardcover, \$79.99, ISBN: 978-3319049748.

Over three decades have elapsed since graduate training programs in historic preservation began to be instituted in American universities. Today dozens of such programs, as well as a substantial number of undergraduate majors, exist in institutions of higher learning coast to coast. Under the circumstances it seems odd that no introductory text has emerged that is generally seen as satisfactorily covering the subject. Some explanation may be found in the fact that preservation is not a discipline in the traditional sense of that term. Thousands of people in the United States now earn a living in the field in private and public sectors alike, but they hail from a broad spectrum of fields, from architectural history to anthropology, engineering to environmental law, business management to design, geography to program development. And as anyone who has been involved at the local level knows, activists and other volunteers from virtually every walk of life play an essential role as well. Perhaps preservation is best described as a phenomenon or a way of looking at things. Certainly it is anything but a narrow endeavor.

Some introductory texts seem to be geared as much to this latter group of interested laypersons as to aspiring professionals. In other cases they are just elementary in content, unchallenging for undergraduates let alone those who have advanced to the next academic level. Then there is the matter of what should be covered in an introductory course. How can one give any real focus to the array of pertinent legislation, the nature of groups that are devoted to preservation and others that contribute to it among other fields, the movement’s historical background, techniques of intervention, economic factors, the imperatives of sustainability, determining historical significance and crafting the documents that are essential for ensuring recognition, urbanistic and planning issues, matters of policy, archaeological practices, and lobbying and political endeavors? And if this bill of fare is impossible in one or even two semesters, what should be emphasized within an introductory framework? And who can write with authority on the wide spectrum of such matters?

We are fortunate that Michael Tomlan—whose knowledge of national and international preservation is as

encyclopedic as seems humanly possible—has taken the plunge and produced a hefty, highly informative volume that may come as close as we will ever get to filling the bill for an introductory text suited to persons who are seeking a career in some aspect of the preservation field. He draws from a great spectrum of personal experience, the contributions that his many former graduate students at Cornell have made, and a stunning array of printed sources that are cited in the bibliographies that are at the end of each chapter. His is an essential text and a useful reference work as well. Nothing else comes close to matching it.

The first two chapters—ninety-five pages in all—address the development of preservation, broadly speaking, in the US from the early nineteenth century to the late twentieth. While he focuses primarily on buildings, Tomlan explores a variety of related resources—landscapes, prehistoric ruins, and battlefields among them. Along the way he chronicles preservation’s maturing into a proactive movement with myriad manifestations and the importance of grassroots initiatives in spawning those varied agendas. Many involved in preservation have long been ignorant of its rich, multifaceted past; indeed some of the movement’s traditionally leading institutions seem to be cleansing themselves of their own past. Let us hope that the seriousness with which Tomlan addresses history has a major impact on a new generation soon to enter the field.

A similarly thought-provoking, sometimes critical, approach is taken in the third chapter—forty-three pages—which focuses on national, state, and local legislation. This is a subject that could easily get bogged down in technicalities or simply become a mind-numbing sequence of provisions. Tomlan hardly skimps on the details, but his structure—here and elsewhere—is discursive, providing a rational framework for his presentation. Chapters four and five address economic issues, matters that have been central to preservation’s success in recent decades, but ones that are all too often relegated to superficial treatment in surveys. The first of these chapters deals with broad categories such as property appraisal, commercial revitalization, and heritage tourism. The next explores the enormous impact rehabilitation tax credits and tax incentives have had on making preservation a mainstream endeavor.

Chapter six is less cohesive. It begins by stressing the importance of documenting historic resources as a basis for planning and action—a fundamental matter that many preservationists ignore. (Witness the vast areas of the country that have never been surveyed, the many other places that have been poorly surveyed, and the fact that most surveys are now two or more decades out of date.) The text then switches to another pressing, and always controversial, issue—design within a preservation context; then, briefly, to matters of sustainability; then to defining terms (“restoration,” “rehabilitation,” etc.); then to elevated transit corridors (more a matter of urban design than preservation), redundant military sites, and finally natural disasters. All these matters deserve attention, and Tomlan does them justice with engaging case studies in many instances. But each could form a chapter in itself. Clumping them together underscores the difficulty in covering so many key topics while keeping the book to a manageable size.

A greater sense of direction is found in chapter seven, which addresses matters of advocacy and ethics. Many preservationists would not make such a coupling. Advocacy has become a key component of the movement at all levels and for numerous reasons. But ethics is a matter the generally boosterish literature of preservation skirts. Tomlan hits it head on: facadism as a cop-out, a weak-kneed capitulation that saves very little and often reduces that which is saved to a caricature. Then there is demolition in the name of preservation. Here he introduces two of the most notorious cases: the Century Building in St. Louis and the Neutra-designed Visitor Center at Gettysburg. The fact that both were sanctioned by the National Trust for Historic Preservation should be cause for alarm. Finally he introduces the thorny matter of gentrification, underscoring the complexities of this phenomenon that are overlooked by critics.

The final chapter, on preserving religious properties, might seem strange for a survey text, but the case study it presents provides a number of instructive lessons. First: really get to know the nature of the resource you seek to preserve, not just in terms of history, not just in terms of bricks and mortar, but also in terms of the people who occupy the spaces—their values, their needs, their objectives. Second: protecting such buildings, especially when

they continue to serve as houses of worship has proven to be one of the thorniest issues in the field, from a legal perspective as well as from an economic and social one. Third: despite such challenges, strategies have been developed and successfully implemented in many cases to resolve these situations to everyone's (or nearly everyone's) benefit—a testament to the ingenuity that the preservation movement has marshaled as it has become an ever more potent force in American communities.

One could indeed argue that since 1960 or thereabouts preservation has emerged as one of the most important phenomena to have defined our landscape—cities and towns, especially. It has helped to fundamentally

change the way places appear, are perceived, are used, and are valued. Today one cannot understand the urbanism of Boston, New York, Philadelphia, Washington, Pittsburgh, Louisville, Savannah, New Orleans, Chicago, San Francisco, Seattle, or many other places without a careful examination of the initiatives of the preservation movement. (A fact most urban historians remain shamefully unaware of.) Tomlan's book steps up to the plate and gives the movement an introduction it deserves.

RICHARD LONGSTRETH

*George Washington University
Washington, DC*